David Whitaker, Esq.
Director
Irvin Corley, Jr.
Executive Policy Manager
Marcell R. Todd, Jr.
Director, City Planning
Commission
Janese Chapman
Director, Historic Designation
Advisory Board

vid Whitaker, Esq.

rector
rin Corley, Jr.

recutive Policy Manager

City of Detroit
CITY COUNCIL

LEGISLATIVE POLICY DIVISION

208 Coleman A. Young Municipal Center

Detroit, Michigan 48226

Phone: (313) 224-4946 Fax: (313) 224-4336

Kimani Jeffrey Anthony W. L. Johnson Phillip Keller, Esq. **Edward King Kelsey Maas** Jamie Murphy **Dolores Perales** Analine Powers, Ph.D. W. Akilah Redmond Rebecca Savage Sabrina Shockley **Renee Short** Floyd Stanley Thomas Stephens, Esq. **Timarie Szwed** Theresa Thomas Janice Tillmon Ian Tomashik **Emberly Vick** Ashley A. Wilson

John Alexander
LaKisha Barclift, Esq.
Paige Blessman
M. Rory Bolger, Ph.D., FAICP
Victory Corley
Lisa DiChiera
Eric Fazzini, AICP
Willene Green
Christopher Gulock, AICP
Marcel Hurt, Esq.
Sandra Jeffers

TO: Christal Phillips, Executive Director

Board of Ethics

FROM: David Whitaker, Director

Legislative Policy Division Staff

DATE: March 27, 2025

RE: 2025-2026 Budget Analysis

Attached is our budget analysis regarding your agency's budget for the 2025-2026 Fiscal Year.

Please be prepared to respond to the issues/questions raised in our analysis during your scheduled hearing on **Monday, March 31, 2025, at 1:00 p.m.** We would then appreciate a written response to the issues/questions at your earliest convenience before or after to your budget hearing. Please forward a copy of your responses to the Council Members, the City Clerk's Office, and the Legislative Policy Division.

Please contact us if you have any questions regarding our budget analysis.

Thank you for your cooperation in this matter.

DW:vc:sj

Attachments:

Issues and Questions BOE FY 26 Budget Pages

cc: Councilmembers

Auditor General's Office Jay Rising, Chief Financial Officer

Tanya Stoudemire, Chief Deputy CFO-Policy & Administration Director/Interim Budget Director

Donnie Johnson, Deputy Budget Director

Andre Blair, Agency CFO Cindy Banh, Budget Analyst

Malik Washington, City Council Liaison, Mayor's Office

#### **Board of Ethics (Non-Departmental 35)**

### FY 2025-2026 Budget Analysis by the Legislative Policy Division

The Board of Ethics is an independent Charter created entity established by the 1997 City Charter. The Ethics Ordinance was enacted by the City Council in 2000 and amended in 2012. The Ordinance established disclosure requirements and standards of conduct applicable to all City of Detroit Public Servants. The Board is charged with the responsibility for the implementation and administration of the Ordinance, which includes receiving complaint alleging violations of the Ordinance and issuing Advisory Opinions.<sup>1</sup>

The integrity of City government and public trust and confidence in public officers and employees require that public servants be independent, impartial and responsible to the People; that government decisions and policy be made within the proper channels of the governmental system; and that public servants be prohibited from participating in matters that affect their personal or financial interests. The purpose of the Ethics Ordinance is to establish guidelines for ethical standards of conduct for all City government officials and employees by defining those acts or actions that are incompatible with the best interests of the City and by mandating disclosure by public servants of private financial or other interests in matters affecting the City.<sup>2</sup>

The Board of Ethics' role is to investigate and resolve complaints regarding alleged violations of the Ethics Ordinance by public servants, and to issue advisory opinions regarding the meaning and application of provisions of the Charter, City Ordinances, other laws, or regulations establishing standards of conduct for public servants.<sup>3</sup>

Advisory opinions are rendered upon written request by a public servant. Advisory opinions are published by the Board annually in a report to the Mayor and City Council. The Board is charged with monitoring and recommending improvements in the disclosure requirements, and in the standards of conduct under the Ethics Ordinance, in order "to promote an ethical environment within City government, and to ensure the ethical behavior of public servants."<sup>4</sup>

All meetings of the Board are open to the public unless an individual involved in the matter to be addressed requests in writing that the meeting be closed or unless otherwise provided by Ordinance or by statue.

The Board of Ethics consists of seven (7) members who are City of Detroit residents. They must not be elective officers, appointees, or employees of the City of Detroit at any time during their term serving the Board of Ethics. Out of the 7 members, one (1) member is appointed by the Mayor, one (1) member is appointed by the City Council and (1) member is jointly appointed by the Mayor and City Council.<sup>5</sup>

The Non-Departmental budget provides funds for activities which are not the responsibility of any one single agency. Non-Departmental is also the depository agency for General Fund contributions for enterprise activities and for a wide variety of General Fund revenues, including four of the five major revenues (casino revenues/wagering taxes; income taxes; property taxes; state revenue sharing) and revenues from reimbursements from enterprise/non-General Fund agencies of personal services costs,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> https://detroitmi.gov/government/boards/board-ethics

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> City of Detroit Ethics Ordinance 2012, Sec. 2-6-1. Statement of Purpose.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> https://detroitmi.gov/government/boards/board-ethics

<sup>4</sup> Ibid

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> City of Detroit Board of Ethics 2023 Annual Report

transfers from other City funds, and use of prior year surplus. The Non-Departmental agency also records the General Fund contributions made to enterprise agencies, cultural entities, and other external entities. The Non-Departmental budget includes independent boards including the Board of Ethics, commissions, and/or agencies with citywide operations.

### **Board of Ethics Budget Summary**

The Mayor is recommending a \$591,195 General Fund Contribution (Subsidy) to the Board of Ethics for FY 2026 in the Non-Departmental Budget in Appropriation **28351** – **Board of Ethics**, Cost Center **350165** – **Board of Ethics** (**Page B35-16**). The recommended Contribution (Subsidy) of \$591,195 in FY 26 is a 13.44% decrease totaling \$91,765 from the FY 2025 Contribution totaling \$682,960.

#### **Issues and Questions:**

- 1. Please briefly explain the Board of Ethics' new expenditure initiatives, new capital funding requests, operational reform and savings proposals, and new revenue initiative(s)/proposal(s) to be implemented in FY 2026.
- 2. Please provide the Board of Ethic's number of vacancies as of March 24, 2025. Also, please explain the agency's strategy to fill any vacant positions.
- 3. The Mayor recommends \$591,195 for the Board of Ethics' operations in FY 2026. The Mayor also proposes four FTEs for the Board of Ethic's for FY 2026, the same as for FY 2025. Is this level of funding and number of positions sufficient for the Board to Ethics to carry out its functions?
- 4. What are your projected performance metrics for the current fiscal year? What are your target metrics for the fiscal year 2026?
- 5. How many ethics investigations were conducted and completed in fiscal year 2024? How many complaints were received in FY 2025 (through February 28, 2025)?
- 6. B35-4: Does the Board of Ethics have an adequate Learning Management System in place to provide robust online training to the 10,000 City employees?
- 7. B35-5: 1,532 public servants completed ethics training in 2024. How many City employees completed ethics training in 2025 through March 24, 2025? At what year does the department anticipate the 10,000 City employees would have receive the ethics training?
- 8. Please provide a copy of the Board of Ethics 2024 Annual report.
- 9. For FY 2025, City Council added \$125,000 to the Board of Ethics' budget for the installation of an independent Learning Management System. Please provide an update on the purchase and installation of this system.
- 10. In reviewing the Board of Ethics 2023 Annual Report, it appears the Board of Ethics established a working group to revise the November 2022 Ethics Ordinance and Administrative Rules and submit

November 2	Rules for appr 022 Ethics On	rdinance and	Administrat	ive Rules.		
_						

## Non-Departmental (35)

## **Mission**

The Non-Departmental budget provides funds for activities which are not the responsibility of any one single agency. Non-Departmental is also the depository agency for General Fund contributions for enterprise activities and for a wide variety of General Fund revenues, including four of the five major revenues (casino revenues/wagering taxes; income taxes; property taxes; state revenue sharing) and revenues from reimbursements from enterprise/non-General Fund agencies of personal services costs, transfers from other City funds, and use of prior year surplus.

## **Operating Programs and Services**

The Non-Departmental budget includes the following independent boards, commissions, and/or agencies with citywide operations:

- Board of Ethics investigates and resolves complaints alleging violations of the Ethics Ordinance by public servants, and
  issues advisory opinions regarding Charter, City ordinances or other laws and regulations establishing standards of
  conduct and disclosure requirements for public servants. Opinions are rendered upon request by a public servant and
  published annually in a report to the Mayor and City Council. These actions are "to promote an ethical environment within
  City government, and to ensure the ethical behavior of public servants."
- Board of Police Commissioners (BOPC) is a civilian agency that exercises supervisory control and oversight of the Detroit Police Department (DPD) as set forth in the Charter. The Board has 11 members, 7 elected by District and 4 appointed by the Mayor with City Council consent. The Board meets every week including (12) community/evening meetings in the districts. Internal organization includes fiscal, policy, administrative, legal advisor, community outreach, and the Office of the Chief Investigator, which processes and investigates 1,500 1,700 complaints annually. Responsibilities include: in consultation with the Chief of Police and the Mayor, establishes policies, rules and regulations for the DPD; subpoena power for investigative purposes; review and approval of the DPD budget; investigation of non-criminal citizens' complaints against members of the Detroit Police Department; final authority in imposing or reviewing discipline of employees of the department; and disqualification appeals from police recruits hoping to enter the Detroit Police Academy.

## Non-Departmental (35)

## **Operating Programs and Services Details**



## **Board of Ethics**

## Goals, Strategic Priorities and Related City Outcomes

Goals / Strategic Priorities	Timeframe	Related City Outcome	
1. Creation of an Independent Learning Management System	July 2024 - June 2028	Effective Governance	
2. Outreach and Advertising	July 2024 – June 2028	Effective Governance	
3. Board Training and Development	July 2024 – June 2028	Effective Governance	
4. Maintaining Investigative Resources	July 2024 - June 2028	Effective Governance	
5. Creation of New Positions	September 2025 – June 2028	Effective Governance	

## **Budget By Service**

uaget by Service	FY 2026 Mayor Proposed	FY 2026 Mayor Proposed FTE
Services		
Administrative Operations	\$491,265	4.0
Board & Staff Professional Development	\$30,465	-
	\$56,000	-
Maintaining Investigative Resources	\$13,465	
Overall Public Outreach  Total:	\$591,195	4.0

### **Metrics and Data**

Metrics and Data		
	Data	Related Goal #
Metrics	Data	
Metrico		

## Non-Departmental (35)

# of matters investigated from 2023 to 2024	44 total matters investigated in 2023; 146 matters investigated to date as of November 2024	5
# of trainings and conferences (2024)	5 attended	3
# of public servants who complete ethics training (2024)	1,532 public servants trained	1
# of public outreach events (2024)	4 events	2
# of City Employee Resource Fairs attended (2024)	5 attended	2

# CITY OF DETROIT BUDGET DEVELOPMENT FINANCIAL DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER - EXPENDITURES DEPARTMENT 35 - NON-DEPARTMENTAL

und # - Fund Name Appropriation # - Appropriation Name Cost Center # - Cost Center Name	FY2025 Adopted	FY2026 Mayor Proposed	FY2027 Forecast	FY2028 Forecast	FY2029 Forecast
- Non-Departmental	198,484,062	248,249,628	209,566,662	218,915,212	229,392,010
1000 - General Fund	183,962,521	242,983,628	204,184,662	214,337,212	223,675,01
25350 - Board of Police Commissioners	4,581,541	4,046,753	4,117,038	4,188,675	4,261,69
350002 - Board of Police Commissioners	4,581,541	4,046,753	4,117,038	4,188,675	4,261,69
26350 - Cultural Institutions Support	6,586,000	5,100,000	5,151,000	5,202,510	5,254,53
350093 - Detroit Historical Museum	1,000,000	1,000,000	1,010,000	1,020,100	1,030,30
350095 - Zoo Operations	2,436,000	1,200,000	1,212,000	1,224,120	1,236,36
350097 - Eastern Market Corporation	550,000	300,000	303,000	306,030	309,09
350290 - Charles H. Wright Museum of African American Histor	2,600,000	2,600,000	2,626,000	2,652,260	2,678,78
26351 - Blight Remediation Projects.	10,500,000	5,000,000	5,000,000	7,000,000	9,000,00
350014 - Land Bank Operations	10,500,000	5,000,000	5,000,000	7,000,000	9,000,00
26352 - Solid Waste Services Support	3,388,315	17,074,650	19,274,014	20,137,415	21,011,86
350079 - Solid Waste Contribution for Operations	3,388,315	17,074,650	19,274,014	20,137,415	21,011,86
27350 - Special Services	1,633,775	1,564,640	1,583,469	1,602,652	1,622,19
350370 - Project Clean Slate Operations	1,567,775	1,564,640	1,583,469	1,602,652	1,622,19
350372 - Reparations Task Force	66,000	-	-	1,002,032	1,022,19
27351 - Transportation Services Support	90,726,203	111,044,567	108,600,642	110,184,735	111,797,85
350040 - DTC Contribution for Operations	6,500,000	7,450,000	6,565,000	6,630,650	6,696,95
350080 - DDOT Contribution for Operations	78,523,185	97,906,791	96,290,988	97,751,985	99,240,77
350081 - DDoT Contribution for Legacy Debt	1,363,410	1,346,476	1,359,941	1,373,540	-
350090 - Airport Contribution for Operations	4,039,608	4,041,300	4,081,713	4,122,530	1,387,27 4,163,75
350140 - Detroit Port Authority	300,000	300,000	303,000	306,030	
27352 - Community Programs Support	1,000,000	500,000	505,000	510,050	309,09
350230 - Childhood Education & Enrichment Support	1,000,000	500,000	505,000	510,050	515,15
28351 - Board of Ethics	682,960	591,195	601,233	611,458	515,15
350165 - Board of Ethics			001,233	011,438	621,87

# CITY OF DETROIT BUDGET DEVELOPMENT POSITION DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER DEPARTMENT 35 - NON-DEPARTMENTAL

partment # - Department Name					
Fund # - Fund Name Appropriation # - Appropriation Name Cost Center # - Cost Center Name Job Code - Job Title	FY2025 Adopted	FY2026 Mayor Proposed	FY2027 Forecast	FY2028 Forecast	FY2029 Forecast
932510 - Senior Investigator Police Commission	5.00	5.00	5.00	5.00	5.00
932512 - Attorney To The Board Of Police Commissioners	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00
27350 - Special Services	12.00	12.00	12.00	12.00	12.00
350370 - Project Clean Slate Operations	11.00	12.00	12.00	12.00	12.00
111003 - Project Manager Analytics Specialist 3	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00
929108 - Administrative Special Services Staff 3 Exempt	1.00	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00
929101 - Administrative Special Services Staff 1	0.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00
929102 - Administrative Special Services Staff 2	2.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
929107 - Administrative Special Services Staff 2 Exempt	1.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
013376 - Executive Administrative Assistant 2	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00
43601103 - Administrative Assistant 3	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00
43601104 - Administrative Assistant 4	3.00	4.00	4.00	4.00	4.00
091157 - Supervising Assistant Corporation Counsel	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00
350372 - Reparations Task Force	1.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
010200 - Project Manager	1.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
28351 - Board of Ethics	4.00	4.00	4.00	4.00	4.00
350165 - Board of Ethics	4.00	4.00	4.00	4.00	4.00
13111002 - Project Manager Analytics Specialist 2	0.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00
929107 - Administrative Special Services Staff 2 Exempt	1.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
010126 - Executive Director Board Of Ethics	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00
011726 - Investigator Board Of Ethics	1.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
011727 - Senior Investigator Board of Ethics	0.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00
931628 - Administrative Assistant Grade 2 Board Of Ethnics	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00
28352 - Media Services & Communications	16.00	17.00	17.00	17.00	17.00
350325 - Communications Services	9.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
193035 - Principal Graphic Designer	1.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00